



Cytoplasmic Male Sterility (CMS) in Cauliflower Breeding: A Review

**Bhallan Singh Sekhon^{1*}, Yudhvir Singh¹, Surbhi Sharma², Simran Sharma³,
Arti Verma⁴, Vishalakshi¹ and Harmanjeet Singh⁵**

¹Department of Vegetable Science and Floriculture, CSK Himachal Pradesh Krishi Vishvavidyalaya, Palampur, H.P., 176062, India.

²Department of Agriculture, Government of Himachal Pradesh, Solan, 173212, H.P., India.

³School of Agricultural Sciences, Jaipur National University, Jaipur, Rajasthan, 302017, India.

⁴Punjab Agricultural University, Krishi Vigyan Kendra, Mansa, Punjab, 151505, India.

⁵Department of Soil Science, Punjab Agricultural University, Ludhiana, 141004, Punjab, India.

Authors' contributions

This work was carried out in collaboration between all authors. Authors BSS and YS designed the study, wrote the protocol and wrote the first draft of the manuscript. Authors Surbhi Sharma, Simran Sharma and AV managed the literature searches. Authors Vishalakshi and HS helped in writing the manuscript. All authors read and approved the final manuscript.

Article Information

DOI: 10.9734/AIR/2018/42884

Editor(s):

(1) Paola Deligios, Department of Agriculture, University of Sassari, Italy.

Reviewers:

(1) Clint Magill, Texas A&M University, USA.

(2) Tomohiko Kubo, Hokkaido University, Japan.

Complete Peer review History: <http://www.sciencedomain.org/review-history/25626>

Review Article

Received 1st May 2018
Accepted 12th July 2018
Published 21st July 2018

ABSTRACT

Cauliflower (*Brassica oleracea* L. var. *botrytis* L.), a member of family *Brassicaceae*, is one of the principal vegetable crops cultivated throughout the world. To elevate the productivity and enhance the quality, hybrid breeding of cauliflower is the most reliable option. Hybrid cauliflower seed may be produced without costly, labour intensive emasculation pollination systems and climate affected self-incompatibility systems, by the utilization of cytoplasmic male sterility (CMS). CMS has gained popularity among public as well as private sector as a most trustworthy breeding opportunity. Interaction of a mitochondrial CMS gene and a nuclear fertility restoring (*Rf*) genes resulted in the production of non-functional pollen which helped to achieve 100% purity in hybrids. CMS emerged as the more adequate and valuable system for cauliflower hybrid breeding, as fertility restoration is not desired, crop being harvested as a vegetative produce (curd stage). Biotechnological tools

*Corresponding author: E-mail: bhallansekhn3249@gmail.com;

nowadays have been explored to improve the available CMS germplasm. In this review, we provide insights into the history, effects of cytoplasm on growth and flower characteristics, utilization of biotechnological tools along with the advantages, practical implications and future prospects of CMS for cauliflower hybrid breeding.

Keywords: *Cauliflower; cytoplasmic male sterility; F₁ hybrid; heterosis; Rf gene.*

1. INTRODUCTION

Cauliflower (*Brassica oleracea* L. var. *botrytis* L.) is one of the most important cruciferous vegetable crops that manifests heterosis [1,2]. Heterosis in cauliflower has been reported for important characters like earliness [3,4] and yield related traits [5,6,7]. Despite such reports of heterosis in cauliflower, its commercial exploitation is lagging behind mainly due to the high cost of hybrid seed production. To overcome this limitation, CMS could be the most viable option [8,9,10]. CMS is being phased in for hybrid seed production since it is more reliable in protecting the proprietary of inbred lines to be used as parents [11] and for achieving hybridization rates of up to 100% [12]. Moreover, it has gained popularity among vegetable breeders [13]. The private sector is leading in this perspective. Reports of using CMS since the late 1990s are there viz., testing of improved 'Ogura' cytoplasm [14] and utilization of hybrid CMS lines cauliflower by seed companies in France [15]. Further, there are examples of CMS based hybrids released by seed companies, for instance, freedom cauliflower (<http://jordanseeds.com/cauliflower-hybrid/>) by Jordan seeds inc. Woodbury, MN 55125, USA.

Most of the Indian private sector seed companies are importing cauliflower hybrid seeds in bulk (10-20 tons/year) from overseas i.e., from Japan, Taiwan, Korea and China [16]. However, some of these companies are now using CMS system for hybrid development in India [17]. For instance, Seminis Vegetable Seeds inc. obtained patent (us patent 6046383, April 4, 2000) for "Cytoplasmic male sterile *Brassica oleracea* plants and the method of producing such plants" through protoplast fusion and conventional back-crossing methods [18]. In past years, only a few hybrids (with mechanisms other than CMS) have been developed by public sector cauliflower breeders (Pusa Kartik Sankar and Pusa Hybrid-2, through the use of a Self-incompatibility (SI) system) and were the only hybrids made available to farmers [19]. Limited research related to hybrids could be attributed to the high cost of seed production and instability of the mechanisms used. This provides the opportunity

to the private sector to sell their imported hybrid seeds at relatively high cost to farmers, which greatly affects the farmer's wellbeing through the increase in the cost of production. At this juncture, it becomes the responsibility of public institutions to narrow such gaps of hybrid seed production to make these seeds available to farmers at low cost.

Thinking on the same line, research work based on establishing an economical method i.e., CMS viz., development and characterization [20], in vitro maintenance [10], evaluation [21,2,22] and molecular-agronomic characterization [23] of CMS lines has been initiated at Indian Agricultural Research Institute (IARI), Regional Station, Katrain, Kullu Valley, Himachal Pradesh. Similarly, CMS based early and mid-maturity cauliflower lines were taken up for combining ability studies by Indian Agricultural Research Institute IARI, New Delhi [24]. CSK Himachal Pradesh Krishi Vishvavidyalaya, Palampur (H.P.) also developed CMS lines in mid-late and late groups which are under investigation and these might play an important role for economical hybrid seed production in cauliflower and could benefit the farmers.

2. HISTORY OF CMS

Cytoplasmic male sterility is not apparently found in cauliflower or other cole crops but has been introduced from other sources [18]. In Brassicas, efforts were made by many workers to transfer *B. oleracea* CMS lines from *B. nigra* [25], *Raphanus sativus* (Ogura type) [26], *B. napus* L. (pol cytoplasm) [27], *B. rapa* spp. *pekinensis* [28] in the referenced studies. But those CMS systems confer poor stability as well as poor agronomic traits which could be attributed to functional incompatibility between the *B. napus* nucleus and *R. sativus* chloroplasts. To overcome this problem, further research was carried out, where [29,30] and [31] made a successful attempt and isolated the stable CMS lines from different sources viz., *Raphanus sativus*, *B. tournefortii* and *Diplotaxis muralis*, respectively. The plants/species derived from these types of cytoplasm had chlorotic leaves and floral deformities. Improved Ogura based system was

exploited in case of cauliflower where CMS lines were developed through repeated backcrossing. Furthermore attempts were made to minimize the related problems through understanding of molecular biology via the use of biotechnological interventions like somatic hybridization [32,15], plant regeneration from cultured mesophyll cells [33], molecular cloning of CMS gene (orf 138) [34] and Rf gene (orf 687) [35], interspecific hybridization and embryo culture [36], and in-vitro maintenance of CMS lines [10]. Interspecific hybridization and embryo culture might create an opportunity for developing biotic and abiotic resistant CMS lines besides diversifying CMS sources [37]. Improved Ogura systems have been exploited world over for hybrid breeding of cauliflower nowadays [13].

3. DEVELOPING CMS LINES IN CAULIFLOWER

CMS identified in Japanese radish by [26] was introduced to broccoli [29,38] which was then transferred to cauliflower [39,40]. Later on, Ogu-Cms was introduced to heat tolerant Indian cauliflower from kale male sterile (MS) lines (MS-91, MS-51, MS-11, MS-110) and broccoli MS lines (MS-01, MS-04, MS-05, MS-09, MS-10) through repeated backcrosses and are in pipeline for heterosis breeding [18]. Another report of CMS being introduced to cauliflower [41] from cabbage (already introgressed with male sterility from *B. napus*), [42] is also available.

4. BASIC STEPS IN THE USE OF CMS

Three lines play a major role in the use of CMS system. First is, A line (with good floral and agronomic traits) used as female parent, It is basically a line of desired genetic background (genetically Srfrf) where s stands for sterile cytoplasm and rf for a recessive male sterility gene. To maintain A line, an isogenic line with the genetic background of A line known as B line (maintainer), is required. To utilize this system for hybrid seed production, the third line commonly known as C line (male parent) is there which also acts as the best specific combiner with A-line. Genetically this could be N/S-Rf/- (fertility restoration) or Nrfrf since the economic product in cauliflower is not the true seed. To carry out further hybridization work, maintenance of A, B and C line is the next important step. For hybrid seed production, female to male ratios generally preferred are 2:1; 3:1 or 4:1 depending on varietal characters.

5. ADVANTAGES OF CMS OVER OTHER SYSTEMS

In cauliflower, F₁ hybrids are advantageous due to uniform maturity, high early and total yield, better curd quality with respect to curd compactness and colour as well as for resistance to insect-pests, diseases and unfavorable weather conditions [43]. An efficient, reliable and stable method of F₁ seed production without contamination by self-fertilized seeds from each parent is vital [44]. Manual emasculation and pollination method in cauliflower is not useful at commercial level due to unsuitable flower size and structure. So far hybrids in cauliflower have been developed using self-incompatibility (SI) system [22,45]. Several reports regarding self-incompatibility in Indian cauliflower which revealed that inbreds/lines of maturity group I have strongest self-incompatibility followed by maturity group II and group III [46-49]. In the case of the snowball cauliflower group, self incompatibility is either very weak or not present at all [50,51]. Moreover, SI system poses a risk of occurrence of selfing in hybrid seeds besides problems of maintenance, multiplication of SI lines through tedious bud pollination or CO₂ and NaCl spray [52,53] and breaking down of SI under different environmental conditions like high temperature and drought [54]. Even in case of genic male sterility (GMS), roguing of fertile individuals from the female line at the time of anthesis poses a major problem [21]. To overcome such problems, CMS system offers a better alternative [43,53,55]. Usefulness of CMS-based hybrids to exploit heterosis has been demonstrated by [56]. In recent years, significant heterosis has also been reported in hybrids developed using CMS system for yield, yield related [21,24] and quality traits [2].

6. PROBLEMS RELATED TO CMS

Development of a superior "Ogura" based CMS system with normal female fertility, good seed setting capacity, freedom from chlorosis at low temperature suitable for utilization in heterosis breeding of snowball cauliflower is rare. Introgression of sterile Ogura cytoplasm in cauliflower nuclear background risks undesirable effects like reduced nectarines, less honey bee visits [2], reduced flower size, small curved styles, unopened and partially opened flowers, rudimentary ovaries [21,57], petaloid stamen, pinnate, silk-like and carpellate anthers, split anthers, dysfunctional pistils, closed flowers, flower bud excision and lack of nectar development in cauliflower [58]. Similar reports

have also appeared for *B. juncea* [59,60]. High degree of self-compatibility and subsequent selfing has to lead to a narrow genetic base of Indian snowball cauliflower [50,51] which poses difficulty in achieving maximum heterosis for various characters [61,21]. Losses incurred in the form of the above discussed demerits could be easily compensated by high price of F1 hybrid seeds which is almost 5 times the price of open pollinated seed [21].

7. UTILIZATION OF CMS

In vegetable crops, exploitation of CMS for hybrid breeding and seed production has been a major research priority. Reports regarding the use of CMS in different vegetable crops are listed in Table 1. Now in cauliflower also, various CMS lines have been developed using improved Ogura systems possessing good agronomic, commercial and floral traits by different workers in their respective studies (Table 2). These evaluated CMS lines could offer better options for developing hybrids with desired characteristics. Some promising hybrids developed using these lines (KTH-27, KTH-52, and KTH-51) are in pipeline along with one (KTCBH-84) being under evaluation in AICRP (VC) trials (www.iari.res.in).

Table 1. Use of CMS in different vegetable crops

| Vegetables | Reference |
|------------|-----------|
| Onion | [62] |
| Cabbage | [57,63] |
| Radish | [64] |
| Broccoli | [65-67] |

Table 2. Reported superior CMS lines/ Hybrids in cauliflower

| CMS line | Scope for Heterosis | Reference |
|------------------------------------|---|---|
| Ogu1A, Ogu2A, Ogu3A | Earliness and yield related traits | [21] |
| Ogu14A, Ogu15A, Ogu33A | Good commercial and floral traits | [22] |
| Ogu13A, Ogu14A, Ogu33A | Different quality traits | [2] |
| 8410-22, 8498-2 | Earliness and yield traits | [24] |
| KTH-27 (Pusa cauliflower hybrid 1) | Very high yielding hybrid (Identified for NCR region, New Delhi, India) | http://www.iari.res.in/files/LatestNews/Directors_Report2016-06022016.pdf |

8. FUTURE PROSPECTS

In addition to better understanding and better control of CMS system in cauliflower, further improvement of floral and agronomic traits through interspecific hybridization and perhaps protoplast fusion is needed. Stable CMS lines with superior yield, yield contributing and market quality traits [13] along with the resistance to major diseases and pests must be identified for future use in hybrid seed production programmes. Molecular genetics work will help to explicate molecular and functional basis of CMS. Biotechnological aspects related to various genes conferring CMS in *Brassicaceae* crops have been discussed exhaustively in various reviews [44,68,69]. Such studies may also contribute in establishing efficient F₁ breeding systems in *Brassicaceae* crops.

9. CONCLUSION

From the above literature, CMS system can be considered a "Reliable approach for commercial hybrid seed production". It has proved to be advantageous over traditionally used 'self-incompatibility' and 'GMS' systems on the account of stability under varying environmental conditions and 100% pure hybrid seeds. Significant work has been reported in the northern belt of India in this context and development and evaluation of potential CMS based hybrids is in the pipeline. This could help the farmers in two-way approach; reducing the cost of production (availability of hybrid seeds at cheaper rates than private sector) and increasing turnover (uniform and high quality produce, yield almost double than OP vars) from the same piece of land.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

First author greatly acknowledge the Department of Science and Technology (DST), Government of India, New Delhi, for providing financial assistance in the form of INSPIRE fellowship which inspired him to write a review article related to his research on the topic "Cytoplasmic male sterility (CMS) in cauliflower breeding: A Review".

COMPETING INTERESTS

Authors have declared that no competing interests exist.

REFERENCES

- Jones HA. Vegetable breeding at the University of California. Proc Amer Soc Hort Sci. 1932;29:572-581.
- Dey SS, Singh N, Bhatia R, Prakash C, Chandel C. Genetic combining ability and heterosis for important vitamins and antioxidant pigments in cauliflower (*Brassica oleracea* var. *botrytis* L.). Euphytica. 2014a;195:169-181.
- Swarup V, Pal AB. Gene effects and heterosis in cauliflower-I. Indian J Genet. 1966;26:269.
- Varalakshmi B. Heterosis and combining ability for yield and its components in cauliflower. Indian J Hort. 2009;66:198-203.
- Chaubey AK, Singh BP, Ram H. Heterosis studies in early cauliflower. Haryana J Horti Sci. 2002;31:76-78.
- Thakur BS, Korla BN, Spehia RS. Heterosis studies in late group of cauliflower. Haryana J Horti Sci. 2001;30:233-235.
- Thakur JC, Jindal SK, Kamal N. Heterosis studies in cauliflower in relation to line × tester crossing system. Crop Improvement. 2004;31:217-219.
- Renard M, Delourme R, Mesquide J, Pelletier G, Bouldard L, Dore C, Ruffio V, Herve Y, Morice J. Male sterilities and F₁ hybrids in *Brassica*. Proc. 13th Eucarpia Congress Sci. Plant Breed. 1992;107-120.
- Kaminski P, Dyki B, Stepowska AA. Improvement of cauliflower male sterile lines with *Brassica nigra* cytoplasm, phenotypic expression and possibility of practical application. J Agric Sci. 2012;4:190–200.
DOI: 10.5539/jas.v4n4p190.
- Bhatia R, Dey SS, Sharma K, Parkash C, Kumar R. *In vitro* maintenance of CMS lines of Indian cauliflower: an alternative for conventional CMS-based hybrid seed production. J Horti Sci Biotech. 2015;90:171–179.
DOI: 10.1080/14620316.2015.11513169.
- Muluaem T, Abate M. 2016. Heterotic response in major cereals and vegetable crops. Int J Plant Breed Genet. 2016;10:69-78.
- Shu J, Liu Y, Li Z, Zhang L, Fang Z, Yang L et al. Detection of the diversity of cytoplasmic male sterility sources in broccoli (*Brassica Oleracea* var. *Italica*) Using Mitochondrial Markers. Front Plant Sci. 2016;7:927.
- Dey SS, Bhatia R, Prakash C, Sharma S, Dabral M, Mishra V et al. Alteration in important quality traits and antioxidant activities in *Brassica oleracea* with Ogura cybrid cytoplasm. Plant Breed. 2017;136(3):400-409.
DOI:<https://doi.org/10.1111/pbr.12478>
- Earle ED, Dickson MH. *Brassica oleracea* cybrids for hybrid vegetable production. In: Terzi, M., Cella, R., Falavigna, A. (eds). Current Issues in Plant Molecular and Cellular Biology. 1995;22:171-176.
- Pelletier G, Ferault M, Lancelin D, Bouldard L, Dore C, Bonhomme S, Grelon M, Budar F. Engineering of cytoplasmic male sterility in vegetables by protoplast fusion. Acta Hort. 1995;392:11-17.
- Ram HH. Vegetable Breeding: Principles and Practices. Kalyani Publishers, New Delhi; 2014.
- Kumar S, Singh PK. Mechanisms for hybrid development in vegetables. J. New Seeds. 2004;6(4):300-407.
- Singh PK, Pandey V, Singh M, Sharma SR. Genetic improvement of cauliflower. Veg Sci. 2013;40(2):121-136.
- Kalia P. Advances in improvement of cauliflower. Recent Advances in Improvement of Vegetable Crops. 2015;10.
- Dey SS, Sharma SR, Bhatia R, Kumar PR, Parkash C. Development and characterization of “Ogura” based improved CMS lines of cauliflower (*Brassica oleracea* var. *botrytis* L.). Indian J Genet Plant Breed. 2011a;71:37–42.
- Dey SS, Sharma SR, Bhatia R, Prakash C, Barwal RN. Superior CMS (Ogura) lines with better combining ability improve yield and maturity in cauliflower (*Brassica oleracea* var. *botrytis*). Euphytica. 2011b;182:187-97.
- Dey SS, Singh N, Bhatia R, Prakash C, Kalia P, Barwal RN. Evaluation of cauliflower (*Brassica oleracea* var. *botrytis*) CMS (Ogura) lines for agronomic and floral traits. Indian J Hort. 2014b;71(3):424-427.
- Dey SS, Bhatia R, Bhardwaj I, Mishra V, Sharma K, Prakash C, et al. Molecular-agronomic characterization and genetic

- study reveals usefulness of refined Ogura cytoplasm based CMS lines in hybrid breeding of cauliflower (*Brassica oleracea* var. *botrytis* L.). *Scientia Hort.* 2017a;224: 27-36.
24. Verma VK, Kalia P. Combining ability studies in early and mid-maturity CMS based cauliflower lines. *Ind J Hort.* 2011;68(4):503-506.
 25. Pearson OH. Cytoplasmically inherited male sterility characters and flavor component from the species cross (*B. nigra* L. Koch) into *Brassica oleracea*. *L. J Amer Soc Horti Sci.* 1972;97:397.
 26. Ogura H. Studies on the new male sterility in Japanese radish with special reference to the utilization of this sterility towards the practical raising of hybrid seeds. *Mem Fac Agric Kagoshima Univ.* 1968;6:39-78.
 27. Shiga T, Baba S. Cytoplasmic male sterility in oil seed rape, *Brassica napus* L. and its utilization to breeding. *Jap J Breed.* 1973; 23:187-197.
 28. Zhu PF, Wei YT. Compatibility, production of interspecific F₁ and BC₁ between improved CMS *Brassica campestris* ssp. *pekinensis* and *Brassica oleracea* var. *acephala*. *J Plant Breed Crop Sci.* 2009; 1:265-269.
 29. Bannerot HL, Bouldard L, Cauderon Y, Tempe J. Transfer of cytoplasmic male sterility from *Raphanus sativus* to *Brassica oleracea*. *Proceeding of Eucarpia Meeting-Cruciferae.* Scottish Horticulture Research Institute, Invergowrie, UK; 1974.
 30. Cardi T, Earle ED. 1997. Production of new CMS *Brassica oleracea* by transfer of "Anand" cytoplasm from *B. rapa* through protoplast fusion. *Theor Appl Genet.* 1997; 94:204-212.
 31. Shinada T, Kikucho Y, Fujimoto R, Kishitani S. An alloplasmic male-sterile line of *Brassica oleracea* harboring the mitochondria from *Diplotaxis muralis* expresses a novel chimeric open reading frame, orf72. *Plant Cell Physiol.* 2006;47: 549-553.
 32. Pelletier G, Primard C, Vedel F, Chetrit P, Remy R, Rousselle P, Renard M. Intergeneric cytoplasmic hybridization in Cruciferae by protoplast fusion. *Mol Gen Genet.* 1983;191:244.
 33. Jourdan PS, Earle ED, Mutschler MA. Efficient plant regeneration of mesophyll protoplast of fertile and cms cauliflower (*Brassica oleracea* cv. *botrytis*). *Eucarpia Cruciferae Newl.* 1985;10:94.
 34. Bonhomme S, Budar F, Féral M, Pelletier G. A 2.5 kb Nco I fragment of Ogura radish mitochondrial DNA is correlated with cytoplasmic male-sterility in *Brassica* hybrids. *Current Genet.* 1991;19:121-127.
 35. Koizuka N, Imai R, Fujimoto H, Hayakawa T, Kimura Y, Kohno-Murase J et al. Genetic characterization of a pentatricopeptide repeat protein gene, *orf687*, that restores fertility in the cytoplasmic male-sterile Kosena Radish. *Plant J.* 2003;34:407-415.
 36. Chamola R, Balyan HS, Bhat SR. Transfer of cytoplasmic male sterility from alloplasmic *Brassica juncea* and *B. napus* to cauliflower (*B. oleracea* var. *botrytis*) through interspecific hybridization and embryo culture. *Ind J Genet.* 2013;73:203-210.
 37. Prakash S, Bhat SR, Fu T. Wild germplasm and male sterility. In: Gupta S. K. (ed.) *Biology and breeding of crucifers*, CRC Press, 2009;113-127.
 38. Mc Collum GD. Induction of an alloplasmic male sterile *Brassica oleracea* by substituting cytoplasm from "Early scarlet globe" radish (*Raphanus sativus*). *Euphytica.* 1981;30:855.
 39. Dickson MH. G1117A, G1102A and GA110A. A cytosterile broccoli inbreds. *Hort Sci.* 1975;10:535.
 40. Hoser-Krauze J. Influence of cytoplasmic male sterility source on some characters of cauliflower (*Brassica oleracea* var. *botrytis* L.). *Genet Polonica* 1987;28:101.
 41. Crisp P, Tapsell CR. Cauliflower (*Brassica oleracea* L.). In: *Genetic Improvement of Vegetable Crops.* (Eds. G Kalloo and BO Bergh), Pergamon Press. Oxford. 1993; 157-178.
 42. Chiang MS, Crete R. Cytoplasmic male sterility in *Brassica oleracea* induced by *Brassica napus* cytoplasm, female fertility and restoration of male sterility. *Can J Plant Sci.* 1987;67:891-897.
 43. Kucera V, Chytilova V, Vyvadilova M, Klima M. Hybrid breeding of cauliflower using self-incompatibility and cytoplasmic male sterility. *Hort Sci.* 2006;33(4):148-152.
 44. Yamagishi H, Bhat SR. Cytoplasmic male sterility in Brassicaceae crops. *Breed Sci.* 2014;64:38-47.

45. Watanabe M, Hinata K. Self-incompatibility. In: Gómez-Campo C. (ed.), *Biology of Brassica Coenospecies*. Elsevier Science. Amsterdam, The Netherlands. 1999;149-183.
46. Murugiah S. Studies on Self-incompatibility in Indian cauliflower. *M.Sc. Thesis*, PG School, IARI, New Delhi; 1978.
47. Vidyasagar. Self-incompatibility and S-alleles in Indian cauliflower. *Ph.D. Thesis*, PG School, IARI, New Delhi; 1981.
48. Chatterjee SS, Swarup V. Self-incompatibility in Indian cauliflower. *Eucarpia Cruciferae Newl.* 1984;9:25-27.
49. Sharma SR, Singh R, Vinod, Singh DK, Edison SJ. Self-incompatibility level in different maturity groups in Indian cauliflower. *Diamond Jubilee Symp.– Hundred Years of Post Mendelian Genetics and Plant Breeding*, Nov. 6-9, New Delhi. 2001;155-156.
50. Watts LE. Investigations breeding. I. Studies on self-incompatibility. *Euphytica.* 1963;12:330-340.
51. Nieuwhof M. Hybrid breeding in early spring cabbage. *Euphytica.* 1983;12:189-197.
52. Kucera V. Překonávání autoinkompatibility u *Brassica oleracea* roztokem chloridu sodného. *Zahradnictví.* 1990;17:13-16.
53. Sharma SR, Singh PK, Chable V, Tripathi SK. A Review of Hybrid Cauliflower Development. *J New Seeds.* 2005;6:(2-3):151-193.
DOI: 10.1300/J153v06n02_08.
54. Kitashiba H, Nasrallah JB. Self-incompatibility in Brassicaceae crops: lessons for interspecific incompatibility. *Breed Sci.* 2014;64:23–37.
55. Wang QB, Zhang YY, Fang ZY, Liu YM, Yang LM, Zhuang M. Chloroplast and mitochondrial SSR help to distinguish allo-cytoplasmic male sterile types in cabbage (*Brassica oleracea* L. var. *capitata*). *Mol Breed.* 2012;30:709–716.
DOI: 10.1007/s11032-011-9656-9.
56. Hoser-Krauze J. Comparison of suitability of sources of cytoplasmic male sterility (cms) and self-incompatibility for breeding F1 hybrids of cauliflower (*Brassica oleracea* var. *botrytis* sub var. *cauliflora* DC). *Biuletyn Warzynicy Supplement.* 1989;1:29.
57. Fang ZY, Liu YM, Yang LM, Wang XW, Zhuang M, Zhang YY, et al. Breeding and seed production technique of dominant genic male sterile line and cytoplasmic male sterile line in cabbage. *Sci Agric Sin.* 2004;37:717–723.
58. He CK, Guo SZ, Zhang ZC, Li WM, Qi JM. Preliminary studies on the alloplasmic male sterile materials in cauliflower. *Acta horti Sinica.* 1999;26:125-127.
59. Singh KH, Srivastava KK. Characterization of different cytoplasmic male sterility systems in Indian mustard (*Brassica juncea* L. Czern & Cross). *Plant Breed.* 2006;125:72-76.
60. Brar GS, Singh S, Labana KS, Chopra S. Identification of male sterile lines in Indian mustard (*Brassica juncea*). *Agron Abs.* 1980;50.
61. Astarini IA, Plummer JA, Lancaster RA, Yan, G. Genetic diversity of Indonesian cauliflower cultivars and their relationships with hybrid cultivars grown in Australia. *Scientia Hort.* 2006;108:143-150.
62. Havey MJ. Diversity among male-sterility-inducing and male fertile cytoplasmic of onion. *Theor Appl Genet.* 2000;101:778–782.
DOI: 10.1007/s001220051543.
63. Fang ZY, Sun PT, Liu YM, Yang LM, Wang XW, Zhuang M. 2001. Investigation of different types of male sterility and application of dominant male sterility in cabbage. *China Veg.* 2001;1:6–10.
64. Lee YP, Park S, Lim C, Kim H, Lim H, Ahn YS et al. Discovery of a novel cytoplasmic male-sterility and its restorer lines in radish (*Raphanus sativus* L). *Theor Appl Genet.* 2008;117:905–913.
DOI: 10.1007/s00122-008-0830-3.
65. Mao ZL, Pan YF, Jin YQ, Dai ZL, Wang JH, Zhang ZC et al. 2012. Selection and utilization of cytoplasmic male sterile line of broccoli. *Jiangsu J Agri Sci.* 2012;28: 1511–1512.
66. Shu J, Liu Y, Fang Z, Yang L, Zhang L, Zhuang M et al. Study on the floral characteristics and structure in two types of male sterile lines of broccoli (*Brassica oleracea* var. *italica*). *J Plant Genet Resources.* 2014;15:113–119.
DOI: 10.13430/j.cnki.jpgr.2014.01.015.

67. Jing ZG, Pei XL, Tang Z, Liu Q, Zhang XL, Luo TK, et al. Molecular identification of Ogu cytoplasmic male sterile and sequence analysis in broccoli (*Brassica oleracea* var. *Italica*). *Guihaia* 2015;35: 239–243.
DOI: 10.11931/guihaia.gxzw201309005.
68. Budar F, Berthomé R. Cytoplasmic male sterilities and mitochondrial gene mutations in plants. In: *Plant mitochondria: annual plant reviews*. Vol. 31, (Eds Logan D.C). Blackwell Publishing Ltd., Oxford, UK. 2007;278–307.
69. Gabay-Laughnan S, Newton KJ. Plant mitochondrial mutations. In: Bock R. and Knoop V. (eds.) *Genomics of Chloroplast and Mitochondria*. Springer. 2012;267-291.

© 2018 Sekhon et al.; This is an Open Access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0>), which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.

Peer-review history:
The peer review history for this paper can be accessed here:
<http://www.sciencedomain.org/review-history/25626>